A DETAILED RESEARCH ON FOLDING THE HANDS BELOW THE NAVEL (IN SALAAH)

Mufti Shibbir Ahmad Qasmi

DARUL ULOOM NEW YORK

ZER NAAF HAATH BANDHNE KA TAHQEEQI JAA'IZA

TITLE A DETAILED RESEARCH ON FOLDING THE HANDS BELOW

THE NAVEL

Mufti Shibbir Ahmad Qasmi

AUTHOR TEACHER OF HADITH AND FATAAWA

Jaamia Qasmia Madrasa Shahi

Muraadabaad, India

TRANSLATION BY ABDUL MUHAYMIN HIRA (3RD YEAR)

Darul Uloom New York

PUBLISHED BY 87-80 153 ST, JAMAICA, NY 11432

PUBLICATIONS@DARULULOOMNY.ORG

EDITED BY TRANSLATION COMMITTEE OF DARUL ULOOM NEW YORK

FIRST EDITION DECEMBER 2012

SECOND EDITION MAY 2013

FOREWORD

All praises are due to Allah, Lord of the Universe, and Salutations be upon Rasulullah (Sallallahu alaihi wasallam). Allah Ta'ala has preserved this Deen from all discrepancies and throughout time will continue to do so by means of Scholars. Many trials will come and the 'Ulama will provide solutions for, and act against these trails. One great trial today is an ideology and effort which can remove the general masses from the following of authentic Scholarship, whereas this is a command of Allah Ta'ala and something passed down from the first generation of Muslims up until today. Allah Ta'ala says, "O those who believe obey Allah, his Messenger and those of authority amongst you." Sura Nisaa, verse 59, Mufassireen have mentioned that this refers to the Scholars (Tafseer Tabari). The Sahaabah followed Rasulullah (Sallallahu alaihi wasallam), Taabi'een followed the Sahaabah, and the Tab' Taabi'een followed the Taabi'een. This chain of Knowledge goes on till today. The 'Ulama have prescribed the complete way of following this Deen after studious and in-depth research of the sources of Shariah, namely the Qur'aan, Hadith, Ijmaa' and Qiyaas. This is not something any layman can do, nor is he capable of, or obliged to. They also understood the Deen better as they were closer to the era of Rasulullah (Sallallahu alaihi wasallam). Every layman cannot involve himself in the in depth and intricate study of all the sciences of Deen, this is why Allah Ta'ala has mentioned in Sura Tawba, Ayah 122 that only a group may take up this task.

We at Darul Uloom New York in order to keep this pristine *Deen* in its original form, under the supervision of Shaykh Arshad Madani; Teacher of *Hadith* in the great seminary of India, Darul Uloom Deoband and the President of Jamiatul Ulama, have taken the task of translating a number of booklets. The booklets were given to us by the *Shaykh* and translated by the students of the third year of the Darul Uloom New York. We hope that this will prove beneficial for the general masses and remove the confusion that has been created.

We are of the opinion that the *Ahlus sunnah wal Jama'ah* are on the correct path and they comprise of those who follow Authentic Scholarship including the four *Imaams* of *Fiqh* (Islamic Jurisprudence), namely Imaam Abu Hanifah, Imaam Malik, Imaam Shafi'ee, and Imaam Ahmad ibn Hanbal (محمة الله الله على ا

The original articles discuss in details, proof of specific *Masaa'il* that are generally followed by the *Hanafi* School of thought. This work is aimed towards educating the masses of the authenticity of their position and not to creation friction, strife, and debates. As we are human, we are prone to err therefore if anyone were to point out our mistakes, we would be ever grateful. *Inshallah* in the future we plan to reprint them emitting those errors. May Allah *Ta'ala* accept this effort and grant us all the true understanding of *Deen. Aameen*.

Translation Committee Darul Uloom New York

In The Name Of Allah, The Most Merciful, The Most Kind.

The Evidence of Folding the Hands below the Navel from Ahaadith

In *Salaah*, there are some differences of opinion (*Ikhtilaaf*) between the Imaams of truth, regarding whether the hands should be folded; on the chest or below the navel.

Imaam Abu Hanifah (R) holds the opinion that it is better and preferred to fold the hands below the navel whilst Imaam Shaafi'i (R) opines that it is better to fold the hands above the navel.

Imaam Ahmad bin Hanbal (R) gives a choice of either to fold the hands above the navel or below the navel.

It is preferred to fold the hands below the navel because of the *Sahih¹ Marfu²*, and *Muttasil³* narration of Waa`il bin Hujr, , but some have made 'folding the hands below the navel' an issue between truth and falsehood.

They have also made 'folding the hands below the navel' a target of criticism. Now, in regards to this, it becomes necessary for us to ponder over the *Ahaadith*. We have studied all the treasures of the *Ahaadith* regarding this case and have seen the *Ahaadith* that support both sides. Folding the hands on the chest is found in the books of *Ahaadith*, but all those narrations are *Mutakallam-feeh*⁴. To fold the hands below the navel is also found in numerous narrations. *Marfu' and Ghair Marfu'* narrations from countless Sahaabah exist regarding this.

Besides the narration of Ali (RA), there are narrations from countless Sahaabah regarding 'folding the hands below the navel', among which there are *Sahih*, *Marfu'*, and *Muttasil* narrations. For this reason, we will put forward *Ahaadith* supporting both sides. After that, we will put forward the actual *Mas'alah* Inshallah.

The Narrations of Folding the Hands on the Chest:

We have found three *Ahaadith* regarding folding the hands on the chest:

1. The narration of Waa'il bin Hujr (RA):

¹ Describes the *Hadith* whose narrators are 'Aadil(those who do not commit sin nor do undignified acts) and have perfectly sound memories; its chain of narration are *Muttasil* and it is not *Mua'llal* (it has a hidden defect) nor is it *Shaaz* (contradicting a *Hadith* which is narrated by someone who is more *Thiqaa* [someone who is A'adil and *Daabit* [*Hadith* which is well preserved by the narrators, either by memory or writing it down]).

² The *Hadith* in whose sanad (chain of narration), every narrator is mentioned.

³ The text in which sayings, actions, and approvals are attributed to Rasulullah (Sallallahu Alaihi Wasallam).

⁴ A *Hadith*, the authenticity of which *Muhadditheen* (experts of *Hadith*)have criticized.

عن وائل عن ابيه عن امه عن وائل بن حجر (رضى الله عنه) قال "حضرت رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم اذا -او-حين نهض الى المسجد فدخل المحراب ثم رفع يديه بالتكبير ثم وضع يمينه على يساره على صدره" ورواه ايضا مؤمل بن اسماعيل عن الثور عن عاصم بن كليب عن ابيه عن وائل انه راى النبى صلى الله عليه وسلم "وضع يمينه على شماله ثم وضعهما على صدره" (السنن الكبرى للبيهقى ، نصب الراية ، تحفة الاحوذى ، صحيح بن حزيمة)

Waa'il bin Hujr (RA) narrates, "I came to Rasulullah (Sallallahu Alaihi Wasallam) while he was going toward the Masjid, so he entered the *Mihrab*, raised his hands for *takbeer*, thereafter he placed his right hand above his left hand on his chest. (Sunanul Kubra 2/317, Nasbur Raayah 1/315, Tuhfatul Ahwazy 2/79, Sahih ibn Khuzaimah 1/272)

2. The narration of Halab Taa'ee (RA):

عن قبيسة بن هلب عن ابيه قال "رأيت النبي صلى الله عليه وسلم ينصرف عن يمينه وعن يساره ورأيته قال يضع هذه على صدره" ووصف يحيى اليمني على اليسرى فوق المفصل (مسند احمد ، تحفة الاحوذي ، اعلاء السنن)

Halab Taa'ee (RA) says, "I saw Rasulullah (Sallallahu Alaihi Wasallam) turning from his right to his left, and I saw him (Sallallahu Alaihi Wasalam) indicating to put this (his hands) on his chest." And the narrator of this Hadith, Yahyaa bin Saeed explained it as the right hand would be placed on the wrist of the left hand. (*Musnad imaam ahmed* 5/226, Hadith#22313, *Tuhfatul ahwazhy* 2/80, *I'laaus sunan* 2/184)

3. The *Athar*⁵ of Taaoos bin Kaisan(RA):

وعن طاؤس (رضى الله عنه) قال "كان رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم يضع يده اليمنى على يده اليسرى ثم يشبك بهما على صدره وهو في الصلاة" (مراسيل ابي داؤد ، تحفة الاحوذي ، معارف السنن)

Taaoos (RA) says, "Rasulullah (Sallallahu Alaihi Wasallam) would place his left hand on his right hand, then tie them on his chest while he was in *Salaah*. (*Maraaseel Abu Dawud* (6), *Tuhfatul Ahwazy* 6/81Maarifus Sunan 2/440)

These are the *Ahaadith* regarding 'Folding the hands on the chest'. The first one is the narration of Waa'il bin Hujr, and it is *Mutakallam-feeh* and *Dha'eef* ⁶. In its chain of narrators, Muhammad bin Hujr is a *Munkarul Hadith* ⁷. There is much discussion regarding this in the commentary of Baihaqi '*Sunan al-Kubra*' and similarly the narration of Waa'il bin Hujr is also transmitted from Mua'mmal (*Sunanul-Kubra* of Baihaqi, 2/30).

⁵ Saying or action of a Sahabi (sometimes used for *Hadith*).

⁶Hadith in which not a single condition of Al-Sahih from amongst the Al-Sahih are found.

⁷ A Munkarul Hadith is a narrator who narrates many Ahadeeth that are of the status of Munkar. Munkar hadith contradict Sahih Hadith. For details see Tadrib Al Rawi by Imam Suyooti.

In *Tahdhibul Kamaal* and *Mizanul I'tidal*, he is considered one who has made many mistakes. Imam Bukhari said that he is *Munkarul Hadith*. Abu Hatim and Abu Zur'ah and others considered him the one who has made many mistakes. The details are in *Sunanul-Kubra* 2/30.⁸

The Hadith of Halab (RA), which contains the word Yadha'u 'alaa Swadrih, is not specific. The Muhadditheen have severely criticized it. It is mentioned in A'wnul Ma'hood, and Ta'liqul Hasan, and as well as others, that the words 'Alaa Sadrih' is from the category of Tasheef (error in the script). The writer has committed an error in the script. Yahya had added the word "Al- Yumna", which is not part of the original Hadith. The actual wording of the Hadith is "Yadha'oo 'alaa Haazihi". So the words of the Sahaabi are, "Alaa Haazihi", and not "Alaa Sadrihi". The details are mentioned in I'laa us sunan 2/169. As far as being an error of the script, 'Allaamah Shawq Nimwee has established with detailed proofs in his book, that the wording of the narration of Halab (RA) is not 'Alaa Sadrih, but rather, it is an error in the script, and an addition to the narration. Thereafter, Simak bin Harb is considered Layyinul Hadith. Therefore the narration of Halab is Mutakallam-feeh.

As far as the narration of *Taa'oos bin Kaisaan* is concerned, it is an *Athar*, not a *Marfu' Hadith*, and the narrators between Taa'ous and Rasulullah (Sallallahu Alaihi Wasallam) are unknown. It is therefore unjust and unfair to persist on folding the hands on the chest, and criticizing those who don't by means of *Mutakalam-feeh* narrations.

The Narrations of Folding the Hands Below the Navel:

There are many *Ahaadith* regarding folding the hands below the navel. We will present seven below:

1. The narration of Waa'il bin Hujr (RA):

عن وائل بن حجر (رضى الله عنه) قال "رأيت النبي صلى الله عليه وسلم وضع يمينه على شماله فى الصلاة تحت السرة" (رجاله كله ثقات إثبات) (مصنف ابن ابي شيبة)

⁸ Muhammad bin Marwazy said, "When Muammal alone narrates a *Hadith*, it is essential to abstain from using it as an evidence because he is deficient in his memory and his errors are abundant."

⁹ A narrator who has not preserved the *Hadith* perfectly.

Waa'il bin Hujr (RA) says, "I saw Nabi (Sallallahu Alaihi Wasallam) putting his right hand on his left hand below the navel in *Salaah*." (all narrators of this chain are reliable) (Musannaf Ibn Abi Shaibah 1/390) ¹⁰

2. The narration of Ali bin Abi Taalib (RA):

Ali (RA) says, "From the *Sunnah* of *Salaah* is that the hands are placed one above the other, below the navel. (Musnad Imaam Ahmad 1/110 Hadith #875, *Sunan Darqutni* 1/289 Hadith #1089, *Musannaf ibn abi Shaibah* 1/390, 3/324 Hadith #3966.)

3. The narration of Nu'man bin Sa'd (RA)

Nu'man bin Sa'd narrates that Ali (RA) used to say, "Verily, placing the the right hand upon the left below the navel is from the *Sunnah* of *Salaah*. (*Sunan Darqutni* 1/289, Hadith #190)

4. The narration of Abu Hurairah (RA)

Abu Hurairah (RA) says, "Placing the hands above the hands in *Salaah* should be below the navel." (*I'laa us Sunan* 2182, *sunanul- Kubra* of Baihaqi 2/819, Hadith #239. *Tuhfatul Ah'wazy* 2/78 *Al- Muhalla bil Athaar* 3/30)

5. The narration of Abu Hurairah (RA)

Abu Hurairah (RA) says, "The placing of one hand on another hand in *Salaah* should be below the navel". (*Al-Muhalla- Bilaathar* 3/30 under *the Mas'alah* of 448)

6. The narration of Anas bin Maalik (RA)

¹⁰ In the commentary of Tirmizi by *Abi Tib*, he transmitted this *Hadith* and mentioned that this *Hadith* is *Sahih* in regards to its *sanad* (chain of the narration) and its *matan* (text of the *Hadith*), and it can be used as evidence.

عن انس (رضى الله عنه) قال "ثلاث من اخلاق النبوة تعجيل الافطار ، تأخير السحور ، و وضع اليد اليمني على اليسرى في الصلاة تحت السرة" (المحلى بالاثار ، معارف السنن ، تحفة الاحوذي)

Anas (RA) narrated that, "There are three characteristics of Prophethood, (a) hastening to break the fast, (b) delaying to eat *suhoor* 11, and (c) putting the right hand on the left hand below the navel in *Salaah*." (*Al Muhalla bil Athaar* 3/30, *Ma'arifu-Sunan* 3/444, *Tuhfatul-Ahwazi* 2/89)

7. The Athar of Ibraheem Nakh'ee (R)

عن ابراهيم النجعى (رحمه الله) قال "يضع يمينه على شماله فى الصلاة تحت السرة" (مصنف ابن ابى شيبة)

Ibrahim Nakh'ee (R) said, "The right hand should be placed on the left hand below the navel in Salaah". (Musannaf bin Abi Shaibah 1/290. 3/322 Hadith # 3460)

The method of folding the hands below the navel is established from these narrations. The confusion that arises is that, there are narrations supporting both sides: placing the hands on the chest and placing the hands below the navel. The weakness of the narrations regarding the placement of the hands on the chest has been established previously.

There are seven *Ahaadith* mentioned regarding the placement of the hands below the navel. From among them, the first *Hadith* which is from Musannaf ibn Abi Shaibah is narrated with a very authentic chain. All of these narrations are reliable.

The Ahnaaf ¹² took proofs from these and rendered the placement of the hands below the navel as Mustahab. There is no objection in regards to those who place the hands on the chest, nor has it been a target of criticism. Therefore, in tying the hands below the navel, there is more respect, and less similarity to women, whereas tying the hands on the chest resembles the form of a woman's Salaah (Tying the hands on the chest for women has been agreed upon by most Imams, if not all). Along with the soundness and authenticity of the narrations regarding folding the hands below the navel, it is also emphasized by the Aathaar of countless Sahabah and Taabi'een, which come in many books. This is why it is Mustahab to fold the hands below the navel in the Hanafi Madhab. And as shown above, it is totally wrong to say that Abu Hanifah (R) only took proof from Ali (RA).

May Allah give us ability to understand the truth and act upon it. Aameen.

¹¹ The meal before sunrise for fasting.

¹² Those following the Hanafi school of Law in matters of Jurisprudence.