

# A DETAILED DISCUSSION OF THE 'SOFT' AAMEEN

MUFTI SHIBBIR AHMAD QASMI  
TEACHER OF HADITH AND FATAAWAA JAMI'A QASMIA MADRASA  
SHAHI MURADABAAD (INDIA)

DARUL ULOOM NEW YORK

Title Mas'ala Aameen Bil Sir Ka Tahqeeqi Jaa'iza  
A Detailed Discussion Of The 'Soft' Aameen

Author Mufti Shibir Ahmad Qasmi  
Teacher Of Hadith And Fataawa  
Jamia Qasmia Madrasa  
Shahi Muraadabaad, India

Translated By Safuan Ahmad (3rd Year)

Published By Darul Uloom New York  
87-80 153 St, Jamaica, NY 11432  
publications@darulloomny.org

Edited By Teachers Of Darul Uloom New York

First Edition December 2012

Second Edition May 2013

# Foreword

All praises are due to Allah, Lord of the Universe, and Salutations be upon Rasulallah (Sallallahu alaihi wasallam). Allah Ta'ala has preserved this *Deen* from all discrepancies and will continue to do so throughout time by means of Scholars. Many trials will come and the 'Ulama will provide solutions for, and act against these trials. One great trial today is an ideology and effort which can remove the general masses from the following of authentic Scholarship, whereas this is a command of Allah Ta'ala and something passed down from the first generation of Muslims up until today. Allah Ta'ala says, "O you who believe obey Allah, his Messenger and those of authority amongst you." *Sura Nisaa, verse 59*. The *Mufasssireen* have mentioned that this refers to the Scholars (*Tafseer Tabari*). The *Sabaabah* followed Rasulallah (Sallallahu alaihi wasallam), the *Taabi'een* followed the *Sabaabah*, and the *Tab' Taabi'een* followed the *Taabi'een*. This chain of Knowledge remained unbroken till today. The 'Ulama have prescribed the complete way of following this *Deen* after studious and in-depth research of the sources of *Shariah*, namely the Qur'aan, *Hadith*, *Ijmaa'* and *Qiyaas*. This is not something any layman can, is capable of, or obliged to do. The 'Ulama also understood the *Deen* better, as they were closer to the era of Rasulallah (Sallallahu alaihi wasallam). Every layman cannot involve himself in the deep and intricate study of all the sciences of *Deen*, which is why Allah Ta'ala has mentioned in *Sura Tamba, Ayah 122* that only a group may take up this task.

We, at Darul Uloom New York, in order to keep this pristine *Deen* in its original form, under the supervision of Shaykh Arshad Madani; Teacher of *Hadith* in the great seminary of India, Darul Uloom Deoband and the President of Jamiatul Ulama, have taken up the task of translating a number of booklets. These booklets were given to us by the *Shaykh* and translated by the students of Darul Uloom New York. We hope that this will prove beneficial for the general masses and remove the confusion that has been created.

We are of the opinion that the *Ahlu Sunnah wal Jamaa'ah* are on the correct path; and they comprise of those who follow Authentic Scholarship, which include the four Imams of Fiqh (Islamic Jurisprudence), namely Imam Abu Hanifah, Imam Malik, Imam Shafi'i, and Imam Ahmad bin Hanbal (Rahimahumullah). Although they may differ in many cases, all are correct in their effort to understand, implement, and present *Deen*.

The original articles discuss in detail, proofs of specific *Masaa'il* that are generally followed by the *Hanafi* School of Thought. This work is aimed towards educating the masses of the authenticity of their position and not to create friction, strife, and debates. As we are human, we are prone to err, therefore if anyone were to point out our mistakes, we would be ever grateful. *Inshaa-Allah* in the future we plan to reprint them omitting those errors. May Allah Ta'ala accept this effort and grant us all the true understanding of *Deen*. *Aameen*.

Translation Committee  
Darul Uloom New York

## **The Detailed Discussion of ‘Aameen’ From the *Ahaadith***

Everyone agrees upon the fact that it is *sunnah* for the *Imaam*, *Muqtadi* (congregant) and *Munfarid* (individual) to say ‘*Aameen*<sup>1</sup>’ in *salaah* after *Surah Al-Fatiba*. The hadith mentions a great reward concerning it, but it is not an obligation according to anyone. However, there is a difference of opinion amongst the scholars whether it is better to say it audibly or softly.

According to one opinion of Imaam Maalik (R), it is better for the *Muqtadi* to say ‘*Aameen*’, but not for the Imaam (*Al-Mughni* 1/290).

Imaam Abu Hanifah (R) says that it is better for the *Muqtadi*, *Imaam* and *Munfarid* to say ‘*Aameen*’ softly.

Imaam Shafi’ee (R) says that the *Imaam* should say ‘*Aameen*’ audibly in the audible *Salaah* and for *Muqtadi* it is recommended to say ‘*Aameen*’ softly (*Kitaabul Umm Dar-al wafaa* 2/249).

According to Imaam Ahmad Bin Hanbal (R), it is better for the *Imaam* and the *Muqtadi* to say ‘*Aameen*’ audibly in the audible *salaah*. (*Al-Mughni li ibn Qudamah* 1/290).

It should be clear that the difference of opinion amongst the four *Imaams* is in regards to which is preferable. There is no debate over its permissibility or impermissibility, or whether it’s right or wrong. However, nowadays some misinformed people make this issue a serious one, and categorize this difference as one between truth and falsehood. They say ‘*Aameen*’ audibly is correct and say regarding those who say ‘*Aameen*’ softly, that they are those who leave the *sunnah* of Rasulullah (Sallallahu alaihi wa sallam) and go against his *Ahadith*. We will present to you this subject in such a way that first we will mention those *Ahadith* of *Bukhari* which mention that to say ‘*Aameen*’ is virtuous, thereafter, we will explain the narration of Waa’il Bin Hujr (RA) as the subject of our topic, because narrations concerning both ‘*Aameen*’ audibly and softly are narrated from him. Then we will present five *Ahaadith* which establish the saying of ‘*Aameen*’ audibly and softly. We hope to clarify the *Ahaadith* of Rasulallah (Sallallahu alaihi wa sallam) and the *Aathaar*<sup>2</sup> of *Sabaabah* (RA).

---

<sup>1</sup> The word ‘*Aameen*’ is a supplication which means: Oh Rabb! Accept. Imaam Bukhari (R) writes, taking reference from Imaam A’ataa: ‘الامين دعاء’ (‘*Aameen*’ is supplication) (Bukhari). It is established from the *Aayaat* of the *Qur’an*, that the basis and preference in supplication is to ask softly. Allah says: ادعوا ربكم اذعوا ربه خفية (Call upon your Lord in humility and in secret). The messenger Zakariyya (A) used to supplicate softly. *Al-Aayah*: اذ نادى ربه نداء خفيا (When he called to his Lord a private supplication.)

<sup>2</sup>*Aathaar*: The actions and the narrations of *Sabaabah* (RA). *Athar* is the singular of *Aathaar*.

# The Virtue of Saying ‘Aameen’ in Salaah

Observe the *Hadith* of *Bukhari* which mentions the virtues of saying ‘Aameen’ after “*ghayril maghdoobi alayhim walad daalleen*” and encourages it:

عن أبي هريرة رضي الله عنه أن رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم قال: إذا قال الإمام "غير المغضوب عليهم ولا الضالين" فقولوا آمين فإنه من وافق قوله قول الملائكة غفر له ما تقدم من ذنبه (بخارى ١٠٨/١ باب جهر المأموم بالتأمين)

Abu Hurairah (RA) narrates that the Messenger of Allah (Sallallahu alaihi wa sallam) said, “When the Imaam recites “*ghayril maghdoobi alayhim walad daalleen*” then say ‘Aameen’, for verily the one whose saying (*Aameen*) corresponds with the saying of the angels, his previous sins will be forgiven.” (*Bukhari* v.1 pg.108).

From this *Hadith*, one comes to know that the congregants should say ‘Aameen’ after the *Imaam* says, “*ghayril maghdoobi alayhim walad daalleen*” and about its virtue, but by this *hadith* it is possible to deduce that ‘Aameen’ would be said audibly as well as softly, and because of this, it is necessary to search for a narration which describes it clearly. The narrations of Waa’il Bin Hujr (RA) were narrated with clear words concerning reciting it both audibly and softly, so both narrations will be presented.

## The Narration of ‘Aameen’ Audibly

حدَّثنا بندار حدَّثنا يحيى بن سعيد و عبد الرحمن بن مهدي قالوا : حدَّثنا سفيان عن سلمة بن كهيل عن حجر بن عنبس عن وائل بن حجر قال سمعت النبي صلى الله عليه وسلم قرأ "غير المغضوب عليهم ولا الضالين" فقال آمين ومد بها صوته, وفي رواية ابى داؤد : رفع بها صوته. (ترمذى ٥٧/١ باب ما جاء في التأمين، ابو داؤد ١٣٤/١ باب التأمين وراء الامام ، المعجم الكبير)

Waa’il Bin Hujr (RA) narrates that: “I heard the Messenger of Allah (Sallallahu alaihi wa sallam) read “*ghayril maghdoobi alayhim walad daalleen*”, and when he said ‘Aameen’, he stretched his voice. In the narration of *Abu Dawud*, raising the voice is clearly mentioned. (*Tirmizi* 1/58, new page 247, *Abu Dawud* 1/134, page 936)

## The Narration of ‘Aameen’ Softly

حدَّثنا بندار : حدَّثنا يحيى بن سعيد و عبد الرحمن بن مهدي قالوا : حدَّثنا شعبة عن سلمة بن كهيل عن حجر بن عنبس عن علقمة بن وائل عن أبيه رضي الله عنهم أن النبي صلى الله عليه وسلم قرأ "غير المغضوب عليهم ولا الضالين" فقال آمين وخفض بها صوته. (ترمذى ٥٨/١ برقم ٢٤٨, باب ما جاء في التأمين جديد. المعجم الكبير ٤٥/٢٢ برقم ١١٢)

Waa’il Bin Hujr (RA) narrates that: “The Messenger of Allah (Sallallahu alaihi wa sallam) read “*ghayril maghdoobi alayhim walad daalleen*”, and when he said ‘Aameen’, he lowered his voice”. (*Tirmizi* 1/58, new page 248, *Al Mu’jam Al kabear* 22/45 page 112).

## An Account of Both Narrations

In the first narration<sup>3</sup> ‘*madda biha sautahu*’ is mentioned, which means stretching, but

<sup>3</sup> If we take the meaning of ‘*madda biha sautahu*’ to be “audibly” then the Answer is that Nabi (Sallallahu alaihi wa sallam) recited ‘Aameen’ audibly to teach the *Sahabah* (RA). This was not an action which Nabi (Sallallahu alaihi wa sallam) used to do normally. We can see this in some narrations which say: ما راه الا يعلمنا (I think Nabi (Sallallahu alaihi wa sallam) did it to teach us). Another sign of reciting it for teaching is that

to say it audibly is not mentioned, so this stretching can mean audible or soft. When it can be for both, then the possibility of it being audible exists but it is not certain, and the hadith that has “*rafa’a biha sautahu*” (he raised his voice) is *mutakallam fib*<sup>4</sup>.

In the second narration ‘*khafada biha sautahu*’ is mentioned and “*khafd*” means lowering of the sound. In these words, there is no possibility of it being audible nor is there any doubt. Besides Waa’il Bin Hujr (RA), other *Sahabah* have narrated (similarly hadith). There is no clear saying about it being audible or soft and those *abaadith* which have clear words are *mutakallam fib*. Because of this, the only narration which can be discussed is the narration of Waa’il Bin Hujr (RA). In his narration from the chain of Sufyan Thawri (R), “*madda biha sautahu*” is mentioned, which can be meant to say softly and the narration of Waa’il Bin Hujr (RA) which mentions reading softly is from the chain of Shu’bah bin Hajjaj (R). In it, “*khafada biha sautahu*” is mentioned which does not have any possibility of reading audibly. Imam Sufyan Thawri (R) and Shubah bin Hajjaj (R) are both trustworthy and authentic and reliable narrators, they are *huffadhul hadith*<sup>5</sup> and Imaams of *jarh’ and ta’deel*<sup>6</sup>, because their narrations are authentic and taken into consideration, but in the *hadith* which is narrated by Sufyan Thawri (R), only stretching the sound is mentioned, which can be meant audibly or softly. In the *hadith* which is narrated by Shu’bah bin Hajjaj (R), clear mention is made of reciting it softly or lowering the voice. Therefore, the *Hanafi* scholars prefer the narration of reciting softly and are of the opinion that to say ‘*Aameen*’ softly is most virtuous.

## **The Weakness of the Narrator Does Not Affect Abu Hanifah (R)**

A request to those who are reading: Take special note of the fact that whatever Imaam Tirmizi (R) has said to establish the mistake and doubt of Imaam Shu’bah bin Hajjaj (R), it does not affect Abu Hanifah (R) because Imaam Shu’bah bin Hajjaj (R) and Imaam Sufyan Thawri (R) are from those *Muhadditheen* who came after Imaam Abu

---

the *Sahabah* (RA) used to pray behind Nabi (Sallallahu alaihi wa sallam) five time daily, therefore, if *Aameen* audibly was acted upon then there would be many narrations regarding it, while in *Bukhari* and *Muslim*, there is no clear narration regarding reciting ‘*Aameen*’ audibly . In this *hadith* of Waa’il Bin Hujr (RA), we come to know that it was for the purpose of teaching. However, because of اضطراب this hadith is labeled as ضعيف.

<sup>4</sup>*mutakallam fib* : Such *hadith* where *muhadditheen* hold discussion regarding its authenticity, as had been indicated in the previous footnote.

<sup>5</sup>*Huffadhul Hadith* : According to some scholars of the past, it is a synonym for a *Muhaddith* and according to others, a *hafiz* is the one who memorized most of the *abaadith* and preserved its types (*amwa’a*) and its recognition both in terms of narration (*riwayat*) and understanding (*dirayat*). And understanding its reason (*illah*).

<sup>6</sup>*jarh’ and ta’deel* : (criticism and justification) the *Muhadditheen* use special terms when grading the narrators. These terms are of varying levels; some being superior to others. This is a very vast and intricate field.

Hanifah (R). Imaam Sufian Thawri (R) was seventeen years younger than Imaam Abu Hanifah (R). Imaam Abu Hanifah (R) was born in the year 80 A.H. and passed away on the year 150 A.H. Imaam Sufian Thawri (R) was born in the year 95 A.H. and passed away in 161 A.H. Imaam Shu’bah bin Hajjaj (R) was born in 83 A.H. according to Ibn Hibbaan and passed away 10 years after Abu Hanifah (R) in 160 A.H. The complete details are in *Tabẓibut Tabẓib* 4/345.

Because of this, Imaam Abu Hanifah (R) did not need to take *hadith* from Imaam Shu’bah (R). Furthermore, Imaam Abu Hanifah (R) was a Taabi’ee; he had heard some directly *Abadeeth* from *Sahabah* (RA). Hence, the criticism of Imaam Tirmizi on the chain of Imaam Shu’bah does not affect Imaam Abu Hanifah (R) and his opinion because when Imaam Abu Hanifah (R) deduced from the *hadith* of Waa’il Bin Hujr (R) the matter of reciting ‘*Aameen*’ softly there was no chain from Imaam Shu’bah(R).

### **Five more *Ahaadeeth***

Five more *Abadeeth* establishing the recitation of ‘*Aameen*’ softly.

#### **One more narration of Waa’il Bin Hujr (RA)**

Before these two *Abadeeth* of Waa’il Bin Hujr (RA) about reciting audibly and softly were mentioned. Now, one *Marfo’o*<sup>7</sup> *hadith* from *Musnad Ahmad*, *Sunan Daraqutni*, *Sunan Kabeer* of *Bayhaqi*, *Musnad Abu Dawud*, and *Mustadrak Haakim* will be mentioned, which will establish reciting *Aameen* softly in clear words.

عن وائل بن حجر قال: صلى بنا رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم فلما قرأ "غير المغضوب عليهم ولا الضالين قال آمين واخفى بها صوته الى آخره (مسند احمد ٤/٣١٦ برقم ١٩٠٥٩ ، دار قطنى ١/٣٢٨ برقم ١٢٥٦ ، ترمذى ١/٥٨ ، جديد برقم ٢٤٨ ، سنن الكبرى يهقى ٢/٣٦٠ برقم ٢٥٠٠ ، مسند ابو داؤد الطياليسى ١/٥٧٧ ، جديد برقم : ١١١٧ ، مستدرک حاکم ٣/١١٠ ، برقم: ٢٩١٣)

Waa’il Bin Hjur (RA) narrated, that “The Messenger of Allah (Sallallahu alaihi wa sallam) led us in *Salaah*, then when he recited ‘*ghayril maghdoobi alayhim walad daalleen*’ he said ‘*Aameen*’, and he lowered his voice”. (*Musnad Ahmad* 4/316, page: 19059, *Dari Qutni* 1/328 pg: 1652, *Tirmizi*, *sunna kabeer*, *mustadrak*.)

### **The *Athar*<sup>8</sup> of Umar (RA)**

Umar (RA) mentions clearly that the recitation of ‘*Aameen*’ should not be audible, but soft.

عن عبد الرحمن بن أبي ليلي أن عمر بن الخطاب قال : يخفي الإمام أربعا : "التعوذ" "وبسم الله الرحمن الرحيم" "وآمين" "وربنا لك الحمد" (المحلى بالآثار اندلسى ٢/٢٨٠)

Abdurrahman bin Abi Laila (R) said, “Umar (RA) said, “The *Imaam* will recite 4

<sup>7</sup>*Marfo’o*: The text in which the saying, action and approvals are directly attributed to Rasulullah (Sallallahu Aalaih wa sallam).

<sup>8</sup> Refer to footnote 3 for meaning of *Athar*

things softly : (1) ‘*A’uzu billah*’, (2) ‘*bismilla*’, (3) ‘*Aameen*’, (4) ‘*Rabbana lakal hamd*. (*Al-muhalla bin Aathaar* 2/280)

## **The Athar of Abdullah bin Mas’ood (RA)**

Abdullah bin Mas’ood (RA) was the special servant of the Messenger of Allah (Sallallahu Aalaihi wa sallam) and used to be with him at all time. He said, “At the time of reciting ‘*Aameen*’, the sound should be lowered”. Imaam Ibn Hazam Zahiri (R) presented this narration of Abdullah bin Mas’ood (RA) in his book “*Al Muhallaa bil Aathar*”,

عن علقمة و الاسود كلاهما عن ابن مسعود قال : يخفي الإمام ثلاثا : الاستعاذة ، "وبسم الله الرحمن الرحيم" "وآمين" (المحلي بالآثار اندلسي ٢٨٠/٢)

Alqamah (R) and Al-Aswad (R) narrated that: Abdullah bin Mas’ood (RA) said, “The *Imaam* will lower (his voice) in reciting three things: (1) ‘*A’uzu billah*,’ 2) ‘*bismilla*,’(3) ‘*Aameen*’. (*Al-Muhalla bin Aathaar* 2/280)

## **The Joint Athar of Ali (RA) and Ibn Mas’ood (RA)**

Ali (RA) and Ibn Mas’ood (RA) both mention that while reciting ‘*Aameen*’ it should not be audible, but soft.

عن ابى وائل قال كان على وابن مسعود لا يجهران بيسم الله الرحمن الرحيم ولا بالتعوذ ولا بآمين (المعجم الكبير طبران ٩/٢٦٣)

Abu Waa’il (R) narrates that: “Ali (RA) and Ibn Mas’ood (RA) would not be audible in reciting ‘*Bismillahir rahamanir rahim*,’ ‘*A’uzu billah*’ and ‘*Aameen*’. (but rather softly and in a low voice). (*Mujam Kabir Tabrani* 9/623)

## **The Joint Athar of Umar (RA) and Ali (RA)**

Umar (RA) and Ali (RA) were both from the *Khulafa-e-Rashideen*, their *athar* is that they would not recite ‘*Aameen*’ audibly but rather softly.

عن ابى وائل قال كان عمر وعلى لا يجهران بيسم الله الرحمن الرحيم ولا بالتعوذ ولا بالتأمين (طحاوى جديد ١/٢٦٣ برقم ١١٧٣)

Abu Waa’il(R) said, “Umar (RA) and Ali (RA) would not recite ‘*Bismillahir rahamanir rahim*,’ ‘*A’uzu billah*’, nor ‘*Aameen*’ audibly”. (*Tahawi* 1/623, page 1173)

All of these *Abadeeth* and *Aathaar* establish the reciting of ‘*Aameen*’ softly, and to claim that all of these *Abadeeth*, *Aathaar of Sahabah (RA)* and *Khulafa-e-Rashideen* are wrong is very insolent and misguidance. Therefore, to say ‘*Aameen*’ softly is more virtuous and correct. This is the opinion of Imaam Abu Hanifa (R), so there should be no doubt amongst the Muslims regarding acting upon it.

**May Allah ta’ala give us the ability to understand the truth and act upon it. Aameen.**